

## Conscience Centered Psychiatric Ethics

A Course

Course Directors:

Matthew R. Galvin, M.D.  
Clinical Associate Professor  
Department of Psychiatry

Margaret Gaffney, M.D.  
Clinical Associate Professor  
Department of Medicine

Course Development:

\*Barbara Stilwell, M.D.  
Associate Professor  
Voluntary Faculty  
Department of Psychiatry

Jill Abram, M.D. B  
Child and Adolescent  
Psychiatrist

Course Coordinator:

Linda Altmeyer  
Residency Education Coordinator  
Department of Psychiatry

Notice of copyright.

Conscience Centered Professional Ethics, Conscience Centered Psychiatric Ethics (CCPE) course syllabus and materials. Copyright 2002, Indiana University Conscience Project. All rights Reserved

# CONSCIENCE CENTERED PSYCHIATRIC ETHICS

## EDUCATIONAL STRATEGIES

At the first session a mental health professional, who has volunteered to participate in the course, will be engaged in a semi-structured interview adapted from the Stilwell Conscience Interview (SCI). The residents will have previously had an opportunity, in Interview Techniques, to observe and discuss an interview conducted with a child or an adolescent using the NSCI. The version adapted from the SCI, which we will use, is entitled Indiana University Health Professional Interview (IUHPI). Our purpose is to model for the residents one way in which an individual's conscience, understood to be deeply personal (so deeply personal, in fact, it may be called the heart of the personality), can be discussed in a non-threatening and non-judgmental manner. The IUHPI is designed so that the interviewee is able to regulate self-disclosure while depicting his or her experiences with conscience. Allow 1hr and 15 minutes for the interview. It will be videotaped so that it can be discussed in the next session.

Assignment: the residents will be provided copies of an audiotape:

DeGeorge, R. (1994): Thinking about moral issues. In: *Morality In Our Age*, the audio classic series (ed. J. Lachs and M. Hassell). Knowledge Products, Nashville, Tennessee.

and the course text:

Kurtines, W., and Gewirtz, J., eds. (1995): *Moral Development, An Introduction*. Allyn & Bacon, Boston. (referred to as TEXT)

Listen to the audiotape over the next two weeks. It will prepare you for future discussions about moral decision making and (re)acquaint you with moral philosophical traditions.

Read \* Text Chapters 1, 14, 15, 17.

\* the Case of Dr. Everyperson in the CCPE Course Book

\* Reprints included in the Course Book

Fulford, KWM (1994): Not more medical ethics. In: *Medicine and Moral Reasoning* (ed. KWM Fulford, G. Gillet and J.M. Soskice) Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK.

Pellegrino, E.D. (1993) : The metamorphosis of medical ethics, a 30 year retrospective. *JAMA*, 269, 1158-1162.

Roberts, L.W. et al. (1996): What and how psychiatry residents at ten training programs wish to learn about ethics. *Academic Psychiatry*, 20, 3: 132-143.

Schneewind, J.B. (1993): Modern moral philosophy. In: *A Companion to*

Ethics (ed. P.Singer) Blackwell: Cambridge, MA.  
pp 147-157.

At the second session, there will be a discussion of the demonstration interview structured according to the domains of conscience leading to an overview (30minutes). Background for the course is provided and questions from the outline are addressed. The course itself is given ethical consideration and issues of confidentiality (e.g. who is in the circle of confidentiality?) and potential uses of data collected during the course (e.g. course development, research). Residents will then be asked to record their own responses to the Conscience Autobiography for Psychiatry Residents (CAPR) to be returned next session.

The third session (and each subsequent session) is in group-discussion format. Faculty facilitate discussion of IUHPI (or CAPR) questions 1, 2 & 11. Residents share their responses. Didactic components will be tailored in content and length according to the particular themes discernible in the residents' discussion, but more or less within the framework of the functional and developmental psychology of the pertinent domain--in this session, Conscience Conceptualization, which anchors the other domains. The bedrock (intrinsic) value from each domain will be discussed in the session pertinent to that domain.

Reading:

- \* Text, Chapter 9.
- \* Thomas, L. (1993) : Morality and psychological development. In A Companion to Ethics (ed. P. Singer). Blackwell Publishers Ltd., Oxford, UK. pp. 464-475.
- \* Kochanska, G. (1993): Toward a synthesis of parental socialization and child temperament in early development of conscience. *Child Development*, 64, 325-347.
- \* Dunn, J. (1988) The beginnings of social understanding. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 169-207.
- \* Stilwell, B.M., Galvin, M.R., and Kopta, M. (1991): Conceptualization of conscience in normal children and adolescents ages 5 to 17. *J. Am. Acad. Child and Adol. Psych*:30(1):16-21.
- \* Cloninger, C.R. Svrakic, D., Przybeck, T. (1993): A psychobiological model of temperament and character. *Arch Gen Psychiatry*, 50: 975-990.

Fourth session: Discussion IUHPI questions 3,4 & 5.

Didactic component: Moral Emotional Responsiveness.

Reading:

- \* Stilwell, B., Galvin, M., Kopta, S.M. & Norton, J.A. (1994). Moral emotional responsiveness: two domains of conscience functioning. *Journal of the American Academy of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry*, 33, 1: 130-139.
- \* Fowles, D. & Missel, K. (1994): Electrodermal hyporeactivity, motivation and psychopathy: theoretical issues. In: *Progress in experimental personality & psychopathology research*, New York; Springer, pp. 263-283.
- \* Mednick, S.A. (1981): The learning of morality: biosocial bases. In: D.O. Lewis (ed.) *Vulnerabilities to Delinquency*. New York; SP Medical And Scientific Books. pp.187-204
- \* Ruse, M. (1993): The significance of evolution. In: *A Companion to Ethics* (ed. P. Singer). Blackwell Publishers Ltd., Oxford, UK. pp. 500-510.
- \* Midgley, M. (1994): Darwinism in ethics. In: *Medicine and Moral Reasoning* (ed. KWM Fulford, G. Gillet and J.M. Sosskice) Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK. pp.6-18.

Discussion IUHPI questions 6,7,9,10,11 &13.  
Didactic component: Moral Attachment.

Reading:

- \* Text, Chapter 19.
- \* Stilwell, B.M., Galvin, M.R., Kopta, M., and Padgett, R.J. and Holt, J.W. (1997). Moralization of attachment: a fourth domain of conscience functioning. *J. Am. Acad. Child and Adol. Psych.* 36, 8: 1140-7.
- \* Wolff, S. (1990): Attachment and morality: developmental themes with different values. *Br J Psychiat.*, 156: 266-71.

Fifth session: Guest Discussant.

Sixth session: Discussion IUHPI questions 12,13, 14 and questions 8 & 15  
Didactic component: Moral Valuation and Moral Volition.  
Crosscultural Issues, Relativism, Pluralism.

Reading:

\*Text Chapter 18.

- \* Shweder, R., Mahapatra, M. and Miller, J. (1987): Culture and moral development. In: The Emergence of Morality In Young Children (eds. J.Kagan and S. Lamb). University of Chicago Press, Chicago. pp.1-90.
- \* Davis, N. (1993): Contemporary deontology. A Companion to Ethics ( ed. P. Singer). Blackwell Publishers Ltd., Oxford, UK. pp. 205-218.
- \* Dancy, J. (1993): An ethic of prima facie duties. In: A Companion to Ethics (ed. P. Singer). Blackwell Publishers Ltd., Oxford, UK. pp. 219-229.
- \* Pettit, P. (1993): Consequentialism. In: A Companion to Ethics (ed. P. Singer). Blackwell Publishers Ltd., Oxford, UK. pp. 230-240.
- \* Pence, G. (1993): Virtue theory. In: A Companion to Ethics (ed. P. Singer). Blackwell Publishers Ltd., Oxford, UK. pp. 249-257.
- \* May, W. (1994) The virtues in a professional setting. In: Medicine and Moral Reasoning (ed. KWM Fulford, G. Gillet and J.M. Soskice) Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK. pp. 75-90.
- \* Rorty, A. (199-): What it takes to be good, moral systems as practical directives for character formation. In: The Moral Self (ed. G. Noam & T. Wren) MIT Press, Cambridge, Mass.
- \* McFarland, B.H. & George, R. A. (1995): Ethics and managed care. Child and Adolescent Psychiatric Clinics of North America (Ethics ed. D. Schetky) 4, 4: 885-901.

Seventh session: Didactic: Healing values as horns of medical ethical dilemmas.  
 Discussion: Resolving Dilemmas. Wrap-up.

# CONSCIENCE CENTERED PSYCHIATRIC ETHICS

## OUTLINE

### I. Introduction

A. Why a course on ethics in psychiatry?

B. Why a *conscience centered* ethics in psychiatry?

C. Alternative moral developmental theories

1. psychoanalytic
2. social interaction theory
3. social communication theory
4. Rest's Four-Component Model  
moral sensitivity, moral judgment, moral  
motivation and moral character

D. Conscience Theory: An Overview: see handout

Disclosure of theoretical bias regarding the following inner states: thinking-feeling-valuing-willing. Each will be treated as irreducible to the others. None will be treated as existing independently from the others. Moreover, they will be dealt with as contextualized in moral development. Other theoretical biases-bases for this course are discrete emotions theory ( Darwin, Tomkins, Izard, Nathanson), attachment theory (Bowlby), some elements of psychodynamic theory, some elements of learning theory, and developmental stage theory.

1. Developmental Stages
2. Domains

E. Axiology

1. pragmatics
2. aesthetics
3. ethics
4. kinds of value
  - i) intrinsic
  - ii) instrumental
  - iii) originative
  - iv) contributory
5. kinds of valuation
  - i) value seeking
  - ii) value making
  - iii) value keeping

F. A Conscience Centered Theory of Ethics.

1. While still evolving, our conscience centered theory of ethics begins with the following propositions:
  - i) Valuation exists.

- ii) Valuation has intrinsic value.
- iii) Valuation does not exist without attachment (valuation is relational), cognition, emotion and volition, hence these, too, must have at least instrumental (more probably intrinsic and, possibly in the case of volition, originative) value.
- iv) Conscience formation is one means by which an organic unity of these developmental domains is attained, in virtue of which they are said to be moralized.
- v) Choosing a life with conscience has intrinsic (originative?) value in virtue of which the other domains have intrinsic (bedrock) values. Hence the choice of conscience involves accepting certain values which govern but in turn are shaped by the practice of virtues.
- vi) These values are: meaning, connectedness, harmony autonomy, goodness.

2. Features of the theory, discussed in terms of:

- i). Intuitionism / Pluralism
- ii). Naturalism
- iii). The Naturalistic Fallacy
- iv). Relativism
- v). Deontology
- vi). Teleology
- vii). Virtue Ethics

3. Core Concept:

If we choose to nurture and protect that part of our nature we call conscience, then there are boundary conditions we accept, in virtue of our choice, determining and, also, bridges will be constructed over the gap between fact and value. These conditions specify a limited plurality of intrinsic values, one associated with each domain of conscience. Corresponding to the plurality of values there is a somewhat less limited plurality of prima facie duties and virtues, the unity or reconciliation of which (or, alternatively, the holding of which in creative tension) is an open question for each person until his/her life story is finally told.

II. The IU Health Professional Conscience Interview.

- A. Written Exercise
- B. Demonstration Interview
- C. Group Discussion, Structured According to Each Domain: Bedrock Value, Medical & Psychiatric Value, Related Topics
  - 1. Conceptualization
  - 2. Moral Attachment
  - 3. Moral Emotional Responsiveness
  - 4. Valuation



- 5. Volition
- III. Constructing A Table Of Virtues
  - A. Intrinsic values
  - B. Associated philosophies
  - C. Virtues
  - D. Healing values and virtues
- IV. The Mental Health Professional Conscience
  - A. Healing Values and Moral Dilemmas
  - B. Resolution Principles
  - C. Threats to Conscience Development

## CONSCIENCE CENTERED PSYCHIATRIC ETHICS

### GOALS

At the conclusion of this course, the resident will be able to:

- 1) Develop and use a conceptual framework for an examination of his or her professional conscience.
- 2) Understand the relationship of her or his professional conscience to medical and psychiatric ethics.
- 3) Apply his or her understanding to current and future medical ethical Issues.

### OBJECTIVES

During this course, the resident will:

- 1.1) Acquire or increase his or her familiarity with current moral developmental theories.
- 1.2) Identify the essential elements of Conscience Theory, in particular, the domains of conscience.
- 1.3) Compare and contrast Conscience Theory with other current moral developmental theories.
- 1.4) Observe the use of the Indiana University Health Professional Conscience Interview (IUHPI) with a faculty member.
- 1.5) Participate in a group discussion of her or his own responses to The Conscience Autobiography for Psychiatry Residents
- 2.1) Construct bridges from her or his understanding of the psychological nature of conscience to bedrock human values and from bedrock human values to the healing values of her or his profession.
- 2.2) Appreciate change and diversity in the contours of conscience across the lifespan and among individuals.
- 2.3) Critically review or enlarge his or her knowledge of moral philosophies, from the standpoint of developmental moral psychology.
- 2.4) Recognize moral dilemmas and identify some strategies to manage their resolution.
- 3.1) Review or enlarge her or his knowledge base regarding current

medical/psychiatric ethical issues.

3.2) Examine a (some) current medical/psychiatric ethical issue(s) from the standpoint of her or his professional conscience.

MEDICAL ETHICS/ CONSCIENCE  
SELECT  
ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY

MORAL DEVELOPMENT IN CHILDREN AND ADOLESCENTS

For counselors, therapists, educators and parents:

Damon, W. (1988) : THE MORAL CHILD. The Free Press, New York.

Lickona, T (1983): RAISING GOOD CHILDREN. Bantam Books, New York.

Based on Kohlberg's work. Very practical recommendations to stretch moral reasoning.

Shelton, C. (1989): MORALITY AND THE ADOLESCENT, a pastoral counseling approach. Crossroads, New York.

Shelton's approach to conscience has seven dimensions, most recently described in Shelton, C. (1995) Pastoral Counseling with Adolescents and Young Adults. Crossroads, New York, pp. 22-25. These are psychic energy (the way a person focusses and attends, seen as a limited resource), defense mechanisms, guilt, idealization, empathy, self esteem and teleology (moral principles). Dr. Shelton, S.J. Ph.D., currently Associate Professor of Psychology at St. Regis University is a graduate of our psychology program and regularly corresponds with our group regarding his and our readings and writings about conscience

All of these books are valuable inclusions in the lay library of moral development. Shelton and Damon's work have in common an appreciation that there are multiple dimensions ( or as we identify them, domains ) of moral development and relies upon many of the same researchers: Hoffman, Radke-Yarrow & Zahn-Waxler, Selman, Kagan inter alia. Our theoretical basis, explicitly acknowledging roots in other theories, including attachment (Bowlby), temperament (Chess and Thomas) and discrete emotions (Darwin, Tompkins, Izard) as well as psychodynamic defense mechanisms (Bond, Vaillant, Steiner) is broader than the cognitive developmental (Kohlbergian) approach which underlies Lickona's contribution and even the cognitive-affective approach that Damon, for the most part takes. It is secular which is one way in which it is contradistinguished from Shelton's work.

Stilwell, B., Galvin, M. & Kopta, S. (2000): RIGHT VS. WRONG, Raising a Child with a Conscience, Indiana University Press, Bloomington and Indianapolis.

## Videos

The Childhood Project, Inc.: CHILDHOOD : LIFE'S LESSONS AMONG EQUALS , Ambrose Video Publishing Inc. New York , N.Y.

\*Stilwell, B., Galvin, M. & Kopta, M (1990): CONCEPTUALIZATION OF CONSCIENCE, "Indiana University Medical Educator Resources Program VC5700.

Nova, (1985): LIFE'S FIRST FEELINGS. Coronet Film and Video. Simon and Schuster. Northbrook, IL.

## For Children and Adolescents:

Secular, psychoeducational material about the nature of moral development is virtually nonexistent, although there are materials used in values clarification and moral reasoning. We found the following titles:

Steins, R. (1992): MORALITY, Rosen Publishing Group, New York.

This slim volume of 62 pages is well intentioned but suffers from lack of focus as it tries to cover both stages and issues for an audience whose intended age range is in question. Issues relevant to later (teen) ages/stages occupy the latter half of this book that is apparently (otherwise) written for an elementary school age child.

Humphrey, S. (1995) IF YOU HAD TO CHOOSE, WHAT WOULD YOU DO? Prometheus Books, Amherst , New York.

Twenty five moral dilemmas or problem situations intended to stimulate further processing by parent and the school age child.

And we are pleased to make freely available on our website,  
CONSCIENCE WORKS:

<http://shaw.medlib.iupui.edu/conscience>

Galvin, M., Stilwell, B. illus. S. Laramore Ferraro, intro. M. Gaffney (1998): THE CONSCIENCE CELEBRATION: A story about Moral Flourishing. Indiana University. Conscience Project, Indianapolis.

Galvin, M., Gaffney, M. & Stilwell, B., illus. S. Laramore Ferraro (2002): RACHEL AND THE SEVEN BRIDGES OF CONSCIENCE-BERG. Indiana University Conscience Project, Indianapolis.

Also, consider the children's and adolescent literature with which you grew up, fictional or non-fictional, including biographical works --only now with a view towards which conscience domains are best represented. Pinocchio, of course is the classic tale of conscience internalization. The Disney

version is fine. Another pertaining to pre- moral volition, for preschoolers: Burningham, J. (1978): WOULD YOU RATHER... Thomas Y Crowell, New York. a lighthearted look at choosing, its real and perceived limitations.

## MORAL BEHAVIORAL AND DEVELOPMENTAL PSYCHOLOGY & PSYCHOPATHOLOGY

### Books

Kagan, J. and Lamb, S (1987): THE EMERGENCE OF MORALITY IN YOUNG CHILDREN. University of Chicago Press, Chicago.

Of particular note: Shweder, R., Mahapatra, M. and Miller, J. (1987): Culture and moral development. pp.1-90.

Kurtines, W., and Gewirtz, J., eds. (1995): MORAL DEVELOPMENT, AN INTRODUCTION. Allyn & Bacon, Boston.

548 pages. Contributors offer different perspectives: cognitive-developmental, behavioral learning, personality theory, social constructivist/interpretative and integrative. A final section on new directions in research on moral development includes a chapter by Sharon Lamb and Norah Feeny on early moral sense and sentiment.

Kurtines, W., and Gewirtz, J., eds. (1991): HANDBOOK OF MORAL BEHAVIOR AND DEVELOPMENT, three volumes. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc., Hillsdale, New Jersey.

Lapsley, D. (1996): MORAL PSYCHOLOGY. Westview Press, Boulder,Co. and Oxford.

A concise and scholarly overview.

Ryan, R.M., Kuhl, J., and Deci, E.L. (1997): Nature and autonomy: an organizational view of social and neurobiological aspects of self-regulation in behavior and development. DEVELOPMENT AND PSYCHOPATHOLOGY, 9: 701-728.

### Articles and chapters

Kochanska, G. (1991): Socialization and temperament in the development of guilt and conscience. CHILD DEVELOPMENT. 62, 1379-1392.

Kochanska, G. (1993): Toward a synthesis of parental socialization and child temperament in early development of conscience ,CHILD DEVELOPMENT, 64, 325-347.

Kochanska, G., Padavich, D., and Koenig, A. (1996): Children's narratives about hypothetical moral dilemmas and objective measures of their conscience: mutual relations and socialization antecedents. CHILD DEVELOPMENT, 67, 1420-1436.

Stilwell, B.M. and Galvin, M.R. (1985): Conceptualization of conscience in 11-12 year olds. J. AM. ACAD. CHILD AND PSYCH : 24(5):630-636.

Stilwell, B.M., Galvin, M.R., and Kopta, M. (1991): Conceptualization of conscience in normal children and adolescents ages 5 to 17, J. AM. ACAD. CHILD AND ADOL. PSYCH : 30(1):16-21.

Stilwell, B.M., Galvin, M.R., Kopta, M., and Norton, J.A. (1994): Moral-emotional responsiveness: a two-factor domain of conscience functioning" J.AM.ACAD.CHILD AND ADOL. PSYCH. 33, 1:130-139.

Stilwell, B.M., Galvin, M.R., Kopta, M., and Padgett,R.J.( 1996): Moral valuation: a third domain of conscience functioning. J. AM. ACAD. CHILD AND ADOL. PSYCH. 35(2):230-239.

Galvin, M.R., Stilwell, B.M., Shekhar, A., Kopta, M. and Goldfarb, S. (1997) : Maltreatment, conscience functioning and dopamine beta hydroxylase in emotionally disturbed boys" CHILD ABUSE AND NEGLECT,THE INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL. 21 (1): 83-92.

Stilwell,B.M., Galvin, M.R., Kopta, M., and Padgett, R.J. and Holt, J.W. (1997): Moralization of attachment: a fourth domain of conscience functioning. J. AM. ACAD. CHILD AND ADOL. PSYCH. 36 (8): 1140-1147.

Stilwell, B. Galvin, M., Kopta, M., and Padgett, R. (1998): Moral volition: the fifth and final domain leading to an integrated theory of conscience understanding. J. AM. ACAD. CHILD & ADOL. PSYCH. 37 (2): 202-210.

Ammerman, R. & Galvin, M. (1998): Child Maltreatment. In: R.T. Ammerman & J.V. Campo (Eds) HANDBOOK OF PEDIATRIC PSYCHOLOGY AND PSYCHIATRY. Boston: Allyn and Bacon. pp. 31-69.

Goenjian, A., Stilwell, B., Steinberg, A., Fairbanks, L., Galvin, M., Karayan, I., Pynoos, R. (1999): Moral development and psychopathological interference in conscience functioning among adolescents after trauma. J. AM. ACAD., CHILD & ADOL. PSYCH. 38 (4): 376-384.

And, on our website, CONSCIENCE WORKS:  
<http://shaw.medlib.iupui.edu/conscience>

Galvin, M. Stilwell, B., Adinamis, A. & Kohn, A. (2001): Conscience sensitive diagnosis of maltreated children and adolescents. CONSCIENCE WORKS, THEORY, RESEARCH AND CLINICAL APPLICATIONS. 1(1): 1-81.

Stilwell, B. (2003): Trauma, moral development, and conscience functioning. CONSCIENCE WORKS, THEORY, RESEARCH, AND CLINICAL APPLICATIONS 2 (1): 1-4 and appendices A-F.

## MORAL / ETHICAL DECISION MAKING AND UNDERSTANDING THE NATURE OF MORALITY

### Audiotapes

DeGeorge, R. (1994) : Thinking about moral issues. In MORALITY IN OUR AGE, the audio classic series (ed. J. Lachs and M. Hassell). Knowledge Products, Nashville, Tennessee.

Narrated by Cliff Robertson. If you can't find room on your reading list, try this audiobook during your commute. Takes a little over two hours on the Interstate.

Arthur, J. (1995): Human Rights and Civil Rights. In MORALITY IN OUR AGE the audio classic series (ed J. Lachs and M. Hassell). Knowledge Products, Nashville, Tennessee.

Narrated by Robert Guillaume, this is part of the same audiobook series as Thinking About Moral Issues.

### Books

Kidder, R.M. (1995) : HOW GOOD PEOPLE MAKE TOUGH CHOICES. William Morrow & Co., New York.

Shelton, C. (2000): ACHIEVING MORAL HEALTH. The Publishing Company, New York.

Wilson, J.Q. (1993) : THE MORAL SENSE. The Free Press, New York.

## MORAL PHILOSOPHY AND ETHICS

### Audiotapes

There is also an audiobook classic series by the same company that produces Morality In Our Age entitled Giants Of Philosophy. These tapes are very good for either an introduction or to renew acquaintanceships first made in undergraduate philosophy. Plato, Aristotle, Kant, Nietzsche, Kierkegaard are some of the philosophers discussed. Narrated by Charlton Heston.

### Books

Singer, P. (1993. ) A COMPANION TO ETHICS . Blackwell Publishers Ltd., Oxford, UK.

Excellent and easy to read reference. A very helpful companion to the more difficult philosophical literature cited below. Naturalism, Intuitionism, Pluralism, Utilitarianism, Deontology are each treated. Of particular note:  
Ruse, M. (1995) : The significance of evolution. pp. 500-510.



Thomas, L. ( 1995) : Morality and psychological development. pp. 464-475.  
Young, R. ( 1995) : The implications of determinism. pp. 534-542.

Jones, W.T. (first edition 1952, second edition 1969 with revisions made as recently as 1980): A HISTORY OF WESTERN PHILOSOPHY I - V Harcourt Brace Jovanovich College Publishers, Ft. Worth.

Volumes IV and V are helpful in providing background necessary for appreciating the aspects of critical moral philosophy found in Rawls Nozick, MacIntyre and Williams cited below.

Chisholm, R.M. (1966): Freedom and action. In FREEDOM AND DETERMINISM (ed. K. Lehrer). Random House, New York. pp. 11-63.

Representative of the philosophical libertarian view that free will exists and is incompatible with determinism, older literature on this subject.

Sellars, W. (1996) : Thought and action. In FREEDOM AND DETERMINISM (ed. K. Lehrer). Random House, New York. pp. 103-139.

\_\_\_\_\_ : Fatalism and determinism. In FREEDOM AND DETERMINISM (ed. K. Lehrer). Random House, New York. pp. 141- 174.

A representative of compatibilism.

MacIntyre, A. (1984): AFTER VIRTUE, second edition. University of Notre Dame Press, Notre Dame, Indiana.

MacIntyre represents virtue based ethics. He presents an historically based critique of post-Kantian philosophy. Identifying deep level problems with deontological and libertarian as well as utilitarian moral philosophies, he advocates an Aristotelian ethic without Aristotelian biology. He critiques both Nozick, representing libertarian ethics, and Rawls, representing justice based ethics.

Nozick, R. (1981): PHILOSOPHICAL EXPLANATIONS. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts.

Nozick prefers explanation to argument and if he can't solve a philosophical puzzle he will attempt to surround it by satisfactorily explaining it's puzzling nature. This is a book for those readers who have some moral philosophical background and are serious about cutting deeply into issues. While it is lengthy(764 pages), there are some sections that can be deferred for our purposes. The initial three chapters on the identity of self should be read to lay the foundations for understanding his section on value, which actually comprises most of the book. The section on epistemology can be deferred.

There is a thorough explanation of the libertarian position on free will, and value seeking in a physicalistic universe ( What Nozick calls his effort to “defang determinism”, if determinism is the case) but also important are his handling of the fact-value dichotomy, and the concept of the moral characteristic and moral push and pull.

Johnson, M. (1993) : MORAL IMAGINATION, implications of cognitive science for ethics. University of Chicago Press, Chicago.

Kalupahana, D.J. (1995): ETHICS IN EARLY BUDDHISM. University of Hawai ‘i Press, Honolulu.

The author demonstrates remarkable correspondences between strains of western philosophy and pre- and early Buddhist concepts.

## Articles

Furlong, F.W. (1981) : Determinism and free will : review of the literature. AM. J. PSYCHIATRY 138: 435-439.

The last paper we’ve seen in ‘the Green Journal’ fully devoted to this metapsychological subject.

## MEDICAL ETHICS/ PROFESSIONAL MORAL DEVELOPMENT

### Books

MORAL DEVELOPMENT IN THE PROFESSIONS, PSYCHOLOGY AND APPLIED ETHICS (Ed. J.R. Rest & D. Narvaez), Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc., Hillsdale, New Jersey.

Self, D.J. & Baldwin, D.C. (1994): Moral reasoning in medicine. pp. 147-162:

The authors identify two waves of studies in medical students. The first was 1977-1985 and the second 1985-present. Studies of moral reasoning have primarily featured instruments derived from Kohlberg’s cognitive developmental moral theory:

Rest’s Defining Issues Test (DIT)

Kohlberg’s Moral Judgment Interview (MJI)

Gibbs’ Sociomoral Reflection Measure (SRM)

one interesting finding by Sheehan’s group (1980,

see Self & Baldwin’s references) in “the first wave”, cited in this review was that “a high level of moral reasoning virtually excludes the possibility of being a poor performer and conversely that a low level of moral reasoning virtually excludes the possibility of performing well.”

In “the second wave”, Self et al. (1989, 1992, 1993 see Self & Baldwin’s references) conducted longitudinal studies on the possible effects of medical education on moral development and concluded that there was a “lack of increase in moral reasoning and development generally expected in this age group, suggesting a possible inhibiting effect of this educational experience.” They also

introduced the empirical assessment of moral reasoning in the evaluation of teaching medical ethics. They found an increase in moral reasoning level in students exposed to the medical ethics course regardless of format (either lecture and case study discussion). Another interesting finding by Baldwin et al. 1991, cited in the review): there have been consistently higher moral reasoning scores in women than in men in every year of medical school.

Looking specifically at moral orientation in medical students with the Gilligan Real Life Conflict and Choice Interview (Brown et al., 1988 cited in review) Self et al. (1993 cited in review) conclude that "there may be other moral aspects besides justice and care that form the structure of moral reasoning in medical students ...Other possible moral ideals need to be explored , including those of benevolence, following authority, and adherence to religious teachings" (italics added for emphasis-M.G.). It seems likely that the Health Professional Conscience Interview (Galvin & Stilwell, in development), an adaptation of the semi-structured SCI, may provide an excellent means to explore this matter further since it is sensitive to 5 conscience domains and associated intrinsic (bedrock) values is not constrained by the bipolar analysis for justice and care.

Duckett, L. & Ryden, M. ( 1994) Education for ethical nursing practice. pp.51-69:

The authors report on their multi -course sequential learning approach (MCSL) which weaves in an identifiable strand of content throughout the curriculum in a vertical course with units embedded in existing courses across various levels of a program. Ethics in nursing can be viewed as the intersection of three overlapping discipline: nursing, philosophy (seen as prescriptive, especially of tolerance ) and moral psychology ( seen as descriptive). The authors advocate an integrative theory of nursing ethics that synthesizes caring and justice and have utilized Rest's four-component model of moral action: moral sensitivity, moral reasoning, moral commitment or motivation, moral character but add implementing the moral decision. They report gains on DIT scores and a positive correlation between clinical performance and moral reasoning.

## Articles

McFarland, B.H. & George, R. A. (1995): Ethics and managed care. CHILD AND ADOLESCENT PSYCHIATRIC CLINICS OF NORTH AMERICA ( Ethics ed. D. Schetky) 4, 4: 885-901.

Nadelson, C. (1993): Ethics, empathy, and gender in health care. AM J PSYCHIATRY 150:1309-1314.

Pellegrino,E.D. (1993) : The metamorphosis of medical ethics, a 30 year retrospective. JAMA , 269, 1158-1162.

Roberts L. & McCarty T. , eds. (1996) : Special Theme: Education of Psychiatry Residents in Ethics. ACADEMIC PSYCHIATRY, 20,3: entire issue.

And, on our website, CONSCIENCE WORKS:  
[http:// shaw.medlib.iupui.edu/conscience](http://shaw.medlib.iupui.edu/conscience)

Gaffney, M., Galvin, M., and Stilwell, B. (2002): Conscience sensitive medical education. CONSCIENCE WORKS, CONSCIENCE AND ETHICS. 1(1):1-17, 2002